

U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
Science Advisory Board  
Committee: Advisory Council on Clean Air Compliance Analysis (Council)  
Health Effects Subcommittee (HES)  
Public Teleconference

Summary Minutes of Public Teleconference  
Date: May 29, 2003

**Committee Members:** (See Roster - Attachment A.)

**Date and Time:** 12 pm to 12:45 pm, May 29, 2003 (See Federal Register Notice - Attachment B).

**Location:** By Teleconference only

**Purpose:** The purpose of the call was to provide the Health Effects Subcommittee (HES) with the opportunity to: (1) clarify the charge question related to the "analytical blueprint" for the third Section 812 Study; (2) understand recent Agency decisions to defer several charge questions and revise review material and; (3) discuss scheduling of review activities, given a previously announced public meeting of the HES on June 11-13, 2003 in Washington, DC in light of recent Agency decisions.

**Attendees:** Chair: Dr. Bart Ostro, Dr. Rebecca Parkin, Mr. John Fintan Hurley, Drs. Patrick Kinney, Michael Kleinman, Nino Kuenzli, and Morton Lippmann

SAB Staff: Dr. Angela Nugent, Designated Federal Official.

Other Persons Attending: From EPA: James DeMocker, Patricia Komen, Lisa Connor, Harvey Richmond, John Langstaff, Harvey Richmond; EPA Contractors: Leland Deck, Abt Associates; Jim Neumann, IEc

**Meeting Summary:**

The discussion departed in part from the issues and timing as presented in the meeting Agenda (see Meeting Agenda - Attachment C). The teleconference lasted until 12:45 pm. There were no written comments submitted to the Committee, and there was no written request to present public comments during the discussion.

**Welcome and Introductions** - Dr. Bart Ostro, the Chair, opened the session at 12:00 p.m. welcoming members of the panel (Roster, Attachment A). Dr. Angela Nugent, Designated Federal Official (DFO) took roll.

**Discussion of Charge to the Council and Recent Agency Decisions**

The DFO began the discussion by informing the HES that the SAB Staff Office learned from the Agency on May 27th that the Agency had decided to defer 20 charge questions and revise the blueprint document sent to the HES Members for review. Mr. James DeMocker described the change as asking the Council and its subcommittees to take a two-phase approach to analyzing the blueprint: first to focus on early analytical steps for the analysis and then later in

2003 to address later-stage analytical steps. The change came about because after release of the draft analytical plan, "suggestions converged" to lead the Agency to revise the document's sections on crucial health effects, economic valuation and uncertainty. He informed the HES that the Council on May 28, 2003 decided to delay its June 11-13, 2003 meeting pending the review of the final integrated version of the blueprint. He described the commitment made by Ms. Jessica Furey, Associate Administrator for EPA's Office of Policy, Economics, and Innovation on the Council teleconference call on May 28, 2003 that the Agency revise the document in a 3-4 week timeframe and provide it to the Council. The DFO briefly described her efforts to solicit information about the schedules of HES Members, Members of the Air Quality Modeling Subcommittee, and the Council Special Council Panel for the Review of the Third 812 Analysis to identify options for a joint meeting in the July-August-September timeframe. The DFO committed to providing HES members with information about the rescheduled meeting within a week.

In response to a question from the Chair, Mr. DeMocker stated that he could not yet fully describe how much the revised document would change from the draft received by HES members in mid May. Mr. DeMocker agreed to provide the HES members with a "redline-strikeout" version of the revised draft.

The HES discussed possible strategies for providing advice to the Agency beyond the receipt of the revised blueprint and a meeting in the June-August-September timeframe. They discussed the possibility of an additional meeting of the HES before the first draft was completed.

The Subcommittee then discussed some general Subcommittee business. The DFO described the SAB Policy requiring the Subcommittee to hold its deliberations in public. There will be transcripts of face-to-face meetings, and substantive written interactions among members should include the DFO, who will maintain a record of those interactions for the Federal Advisory Committee Act file.

The Chair then reviewed proposed assignments for HES members to address the Charge Questions received by the subcommittee in early. He requested committee members to offer additional thoughts on possible sub-topics related to Charge Question 11 by email. One member discussed the importance of chronic bronchitis; another member discussed the importance of chronic cardiac disease as a result of long-term exposures, a topic to be addressed under Charge Question 12.

Dr. Ostro concluded the meeting with thanks to Subcommittee Members. Mr. DeMocker also thanked the members for participating and for their future advice.

Action items:

1. The DFO committed to providing HES members with information about the

rescheduled meeting within a week.

2. Subcommittee members to offer additional thoughts on possible sub-topics related to Charge Question 11 by email.

At 12:45 p.m., Dr. Ostro adjourned the teleconference.

Respectfully Submitted:

*/Signed/*

Angela Nugent  
Designated Federal Official

Certified as True:

*/Signed/*

Bart Ostro  
Chair

NOTE AND DISCLAIMER: The minutes of this public meeting reflect diverse ideas and suggestions offered by the Council to the Agency during the course of deliberations within the meeting. Such ideas, suggestions and deliberations do not necessarily reflect definitive consensus advice from the Council. The reader is cautioned to not rely on the minutes to represent final, approved, consensus advice and recommendations offered to the Agency. Such advice and recommendations may be found in the final advisories, commentaries, letters, or reports prepared and transmitted to the EPA Administrator following the public meetings

Attachment A  
**U.S. Environmental Protection Agency  
Science Advisory Board  
Advisory Council on Clean Air Compliance Analysis  
Health Effects Subcommittee\***

**CHAIR**

**Dr. Bart Ostro**, Chief, Air Pollution Epidemiology Unit, California Office of Environmental Health Hazard Assessment (OEHHA), Oakland, CA

**OTHER SAB MEMBERS**

**Dr. Rebecca Parkin**, Associate Research Professor, Environmental and Occupational Health, Public Health and Health Services, The George Washington University, Washington, DC  
Member: Integrated Human Exposure Committee  
Executive Committee

**CONSULTANTS**

**Mr. John Fintan Hurley**, Research Director, Institute of Occupational Medicine (IOM), Edinburgh,, UK

**Dr. Patrick Kinney**, Associate Professor, Department of Environmental Health Sciences, Mailman School of Public Health , Columbia University, New York, NY

**Dr. Michael Kleinman**, Professor, Department of Community and Environmental Medicine, College of Medicine, University of California, Irvine, CA

**Dr. Nino Kuenzli**, Professor, Department of Preventive Medicine, Keck School of Medicine, University of Southern California, Los Angeles, CA

**Dr. Morton Lippmann**, Professor, Nelson Institute of Environmental Medicine, New York University School of Medicine, Tuxedo, NY

**SCIENCE ADVISORY BOARD STAFF**

**Dr. Angela Nugent**, Designated Federal Officer, 1200 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW, Washington, DC, Phone: 202-564-4562, Fax: 202-501-0323, (nugent.angela@epa.gov)

Attachment B  
**ENVIRONMENTAL PROTECTION AGENCY**

[FRL - ]

**Science Advisory Board**

**Advisory Council on Clean Air Compliance Analysis**

**Notification of An Upcoming Public Meeting and Three Planning Teleconferences**

**AGENCY:** Environmental Protection Agency (EPA)

**ACTION:** Notice

**SUMMARY:** The EPA Advisory Council on Clean Air Compliance Analysis (Council) is announcing a public meeting and a public planning teleconference. It is also announcing planning teleconferences for its two subcommittees, the Air Quality Modeling Subcommittee (AQMS) and the Health Effects Subcommittee (HES).

**DATES:**

**May 28, 2003:** The planning teleconference call meeting for the Council will be held from 12:00 to 2:00 p.m. (Eastern Time).

**May 29, 2003:** The planning teleconference call meeting for the HES will be held from 12:00 to 1:30 p.m. (Eastern Time).

**May 30, 2003:** The planning teleconference call meeting for the AQMS will be held from 2:00 to 3:30 p.m. (Eastern Time).

**June 11 - 13, 2003:** The public meeting for the Council will begin June 11, at 9:00 a.m. and adjourn on June 13, 2003, no later than 2:00 p.m.(Eastern Time) on that day. The meeting agenda will be posted on the SAB website, <http://www.epa.gov/sab/agendas.htm>, one week before the meeting.

**ADDRESSES:** The public meeting of the Council will be held in Washington, DC. The meeting location will be announced on the SAB website, <http://www.epa.gov/sab>. For further information concerning the public meeting, please contact Dr. Angela Nugent, DFO (see contact information below). Participation in the teleconference call meetings will be by teleconference only.

**FOR FURTHER INFORMATION CONTACT:** Any member of the public wishing further information regarding the public meeting may contact Dr. Angela Nugent, Designated Federal Officer (DFO), U.S. EPA Science Advisory Board by telephone/voice mail at (202) 564-4562 or via e-mail at [nugent.angela@epa.gov](mailto:nugent.angela@epa.gov). you may call (202) 275-0170, with no access code--just ask for the teleconference operator and request the HES call. Members of the public who wish to obtain the call\_in number and access code to participate in any of the teleconference meetings must contact Ms. Sandra Friedman, EPA Science Advisory Board Staff, at telephone/voice mail: (202) 564-2526, via e-mail at: [Friedman.Sandra@epa.gov](mailto:Friedman.Sandra@epa.gov). General information about the SAB can be found in the SAB web site at <http://www.epa.gov/sab>.

## **SUPPLEMENTAL INFORMATION**

**Summary:** Pursuant to the Federal Advisory Committee Act, Public Law 92-463, Notice is hereby given that the Council will hold a public meeting to provide advice to the EPA on the Agency's plan to develop the third in a series of statutorily mandated comprehensive analyses of the total costs and total benefits of programs implemented pursuant to the Clean Air Act, and that the Council and its two subcommittees will also hold public teleconferences to plan for the public meeting. The dates and times for both the meeting and teleconference are provided above.

**Background:** Background on the Council, its subcommittees, and on the advisory project that will be the focus of the meeting and teleconferences described in this notice was provided in a Federal Register Notice published on February 14, 2003 (68 FR 7531-7534).

In forming the Health and Ecological Effects Subcommittee discussed in that Federal Register Notice, the Science Advisory Board Staff Office received nominations for health effects experts. It has therefore decided to rename the Subcommittee as the "Health Effects Subcommittee" of the Council and to work with the Council to form a new subcommittee to focus on ecological effects or to develop another appropriate mechanism to consider and give due attention to ecological effects, including coordination with a new SAB Committee on "Valuing the Protection of Ecological Systems and Services."

**Meeting Accommodations:** Individuals requiring special accommodation to access the public meetings listed above, should contact the DFO at least five business days prior to the meeting so that appropriate arrangements can be made.

---

Dated

---

Robert Flaak  
Acting Deputy Director  
EPA Science Advisory Board Staff Office



Attachment C  
**U.S. Environmental Protection Agency**  
**Science Advisory Board**  
**Advisory Council on Clean Air Act Compliance Analysis (Council)**  
**Health Effects Subcommittee**  
**Public Teleconference - May 29, 2003, 12:00-1:30 pm Eastern Time**

**Draft Agenda**

12:00 -12:15	Opening Remarks, Purpose of Meeting,	Dr. Bart Ostro, Chair, HES Dr. Angela Nugent, SAB Staff Members
12:15-12:30	Charge for June 11-13 Meeting Clarification Points from the Agency <i>Is it clear and adequate, given the Council's mandate <sup>1</sup>: and past history of the Council's review of the 812 Studies?</i>	Mr. Jim DeMocker Panel Members
12:30-12:40	Orientation to Analytical Blueprint	Mr. Jim DeMocker, EPA
12:40-1:00	Discussion of Analytical Blueprint <i>Is it clear and adequate to address the charge questions? Are supplemental materials needed?</i>	Panel Members
1:00-1:10	Council Schedule/Process for Review/ Report Preparation <i>Is it clear? Do changes need to be made?</i>	Panel Members
1:10-1:20	Draft Agenda for June 11-13, 2003 Meeting <i>Is it clear? Do changes need to be made?</i>	Panel Members
1:20-1:30	Summary of Next Steps	Dr. Bart Ostro, Chair

---

<sup>1</sup> Specifically, subsection (g) of the Clean Air Act §312 (as amended by §812 of the amendments) states: "(g) *The Council shall -- (1) review the data to be used for any analysis required under this section and make recommendations to the Administrator on the use of such data, (2) review the methodology used to analyze such data and make recommendations to the Administrator on the use of such methodology; and (3) prior to issuance of a report required under subsection (d) or (e), review the findings of such report, and make recommendations to the Administrator concerning the validity and utility of such findings.*"